רב הונא[[1]](#footnote-1) אמר נגודי מנגדינן להו – said, we surely smite them רב הונא

Overview

The ברייתא rules that a כהן cannot collect a debt from his divorced wife only through a third party. רב ששת said if they appear together in בי"ד, we do not pay attention to them. רב פפא said we excommunicate (שמתא) them. רב הונא בדר"י said we punish them with lashes. תוספות explains that according to רהבדר"י we give them lashes in addition to the שמתא.

--------------------------

נראה לרבינו תם דלרב הונא נמי משמתינן וגם מנגדין שכל אחד מחמיר מחבירו[[2]](#footnote-2) -

It is the view of the ר"ת that according to ר"ה as well, we place a שמתא on them (as רב פפא stated), and we also excommunicate them, for each of these three אמוראים are more stringent than the previous colleague -

ואם הוא אומר דנגדינן ליה בלא שמתא הוה מיקל טפי[[3]](#footnote-3) -

For if ר"ה meant that we (only) smite them (but) without a שמתא, then he would be more lenient than ר"פ (who requires that a שמתא be placed on them), because a שמתא alone is more severe than lashes alone.

תוספות proves that שמתא is more severe than lashes:

כדאמרינן במועד קטן (דף יז,א) ובפרק מקום שנהגו (פסחים נב,א) -

As the גמרא states in מסכת מו"ק and in פרק מקום שנהגו -

במערבא כי מחייב צורבא מרבנן מימנו אנגידא ולא מימנו אשמתא:

In Israel, when a student scholar is liable for a disciplinary action the בי"ד will form a quorum to smite him, but they will not assemble to place a שמתא on him; for that is too severe a punishment for a צורבא מרבנן.[[4]](#footnote-4)

Summary

ר"ה requires מלקות besides the שמתא. A שמתא is more severe than מלקות.

Thinking it over

Why does the ב"ח omit the word נמי from our גמרא text?

1. In our גמרות it reads רב הונא בריה דרב יהושע אמר. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. רב ששת said we do not pay them attention, and רב פפא added that we (also) place them in a שמתא (which is obviously more severe than not paying attention to them), and (presumably) ר"ה adds (an additional severity) that we smite them (however smiting alone is not more severe than שמתא [as תוספות points out shortly]), therefore we must say that ר"ה adds lashes to the שמתא (of ר"פ). [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. תוספות assumption is that each one is more strict that the previous one; ר"פ more than ר"ש and ר"ה more than ר"פ. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. See מו"ק there that שמתא means either שם מיתה or שממה יהיה. See also רש"י ד"ה מימנו in פסחים that וחוששין לכבוד התורה. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)